

Draft Minutes, v2

ASC OP/TF 2 – Committee for Optics and Electro-Optical Instruments – Appearance Imperfections Standard Meeting

Tuesday, April 1, 2014

11:00 - 13:00 PDT

(14:00 - 16:00 EDT)

Teleconference Call

(866) 576-7975, participation code 305866

1. Welcome and Introductions

Gordon Boulton called the meeting to order at 14:04 EDT. In attendance were Dave Aikens, Bill Royall, Donna Howland, Allen Krisiloff, Ray Williamson, Doug Wilgis, Patrick Augino, Frank Dombrowski, and Doug Hoover. Everyone introduced themselves. Quorum was established.

Chris Svec joined the meeting at 15:00.

2. Approval of the agenda

Allen Krisiloff motioned to accept the agenda, with the clarification that the first item 4 should be relabeled 4a and the second item 4 labeled 4b. The motion was seconded by Doug Hoover and the motion passed.

3. Approval of the minutes for the February meeting

Several errors were identified in the minutes from the previous meeting. Bill Royall's name is spelled incorrectly in three locations. In section 5 paragraph 6, the wording of the comment regarding V16 of the standard is incorrect. That sentence should be removed, and the following line should indicate that Allen will revise the draft in accordance with this issue. In paragraph 7 there were similar issues with wording, and the paragraph should be corrected to indicate merely that we are removing the /P section entirely. In section 6, the paragraph needs to be revised to indicate that it is the comparison artifact, and not the drawing itself, which cannot be manufactured. Bill Royall moved to accept the minutes from the February meeting as revised, Allen Krisiloff seconded and the motion carried.

4. a. Effort to find and specify a replacement for the 40W bulb – Results of March meeting with NIST

Bill Royall reported on his telecom with the folks at NIST responsible for photonics. They have searched for records of lumen output at the time of the adoption of MIL-O-13830, and they recommend we use the brightness of 290 lumens in our efforts to replace the 40W bulb. They also recommended we may want to switch to

illuminance at the location where the artifact is to be viewed. If we want to pursue this, we could buy or borrow a light meter and measure some of the boxes out in the field to find out what level is being used now. A key issue will be the diffuser on the lamp; opal is too opaque and most people switched to ground glass at some point as a result.

Gordon Boulton mentioned that Doug Wilgis of JDSU provided a nice summary which he sent to Dave and Gordon. At JDSU, they found they could replace the 40W tungsten with a 29W halogen, and got similar brightness as the 290 lumens NIST has mentioned.

Action Dave: Post Doug's summary to the meeting documents page on the website.

Doug Hoover advised the group that there was an ISO standard which specifies light levels for eye charts, which is managed by SC7. That standard, ISO 8596, specifies color temperatures of 2500K to 7000K and brightnesses from 80 to 320 lumens.

Doug Wilgis also reported that he talked to the folk at JUST, which makes the paint inspection boxes for Pantone. They said that they have gone to an LED-based solution which is both tunable and traceable.

4. b. Project leader's responses to participants' comments submitted with votes on OP1.002 draft version 16

Allen said that he has revised the document based on the discussions at Photonics West as well as the comments received during the ballot and in answer to the survey questions. He asked if anyone saw any remaining issues with the new version 17 draft.

Dave Aikens noted that section 2.1.2.5 is no longer consistent with the 2009 edition, and that it should be changed to add section 3.4.1.3.4 from 2009. We could then delete 2.1.4.1.5.

Gordon Boulton said that he didn't like the way the /M was written, but Allen pointed out that the section has been removed, so it is kind of moot.

Gordon Boulton also observed that JDSU should be added back into the list of members of ASC OP, and that Gary Weise needs to be added, and Optimax needs to be revised to remove Joe Tipps and add Pat Aguino. Dave Aikens said that we also need to remove Jenoptik, and probably make other updates based on the membership at the time of the ballot.

Action Dave: Revise the draft at time of ballot to reflect the current ASC OP membership.

Gordon pointed out that in section 2.1.4.1.2 there was a "the" missing in the second part of the sentence. In addition, in both parts, the verb "are" should be "is."

We had a brief discussion of the labeling of the Annexes. Some people didn't like the new N and I numbering convention. After a long discussion, it was decided that we should change them to "Normative Annex A," which would be the scratch and dig comparison artifact descriptions (Annex N-1 in the current draft) and then "Informative Annex A," "Informative Annex B" and so on.

Allen was also asked to add more description on "normative," such as is found in the normative reference paragraph of ISO standards.

In discussing (what will now be) Normative Annex A, Bill Royall observed that the scratch brightness ranges were kind of strange, and even overlapped in a way, since one range might end at 8 and the next begin at 8, making a reading of 8 somewhat ambiguous. It was decided to revise the upper limit of each range to be 7.9, 13.9, 19.9, 28.9 and 64, respectively, to eliminate the potential confusion.

Frank Dombrowski said that there was some potential confusion in the dimensional section because the terms "Letter" and "grade" are not used consistently. Chris Svec pointed out that section 2.1.3.1 clarifies this. Ray Williamson offered that the table columns in the dimensional section could be changed to read "scratch letter grade" and "dig letter grade" to make it more clear.

Dave Aikens asked if we wanted to be more clear about the lighting used for area imperfections, or to provide more controls for these imperfections. Gordon Boulton suggested that this be taken up in the next revision, rather than with the current one.

Dave Aikens asked if we wanted to use the fixed fonts for headings from the old ANSI style sheet, or if we wanted to stick with Allen's completely reformatted titles and section headings. The consensus of the group was in favor of Allen's version.

Action Allen: Revise the draft based on these discussions and submit for ballot

Action Gordon: add area imperfections, diamond turning imperfections, light sources and boxes, and better edge chips specification to the agenda for the next meeting.

5. Any other new business and action items

There was no other new business for the committee.

6. Time and place for next meeting

Bill Royall moved that we next meet by teleconference on July 7th, 2014 at 11:00 EDT. Chris Svec seconded, and the motion carried.

7. Adjourn

At 16:20, Frank Dombrowski moved we adjourn. Chris Svec seconded, and the motion carried.